

**The red mosque incident: a comparative framing analysis in
the coverage of local right wing and western print media**

(June – Aug 2007)



Thesis for M. Phil Degree in Political Science

Session 2015 – 2017

RESEARCH SCHOLAR

SUPERVISOR

Rohail Ahmed

Dr. Fatima Sajjad

ID NO. 15004112005

ASSISTANT PROFESSOR, DPS

Department of Political Science

School of Social Sciences and Humanities

University of Management and Technology

Lahore

DEDICATION

**This thesis is
dedicated to my beloved (Late) parents,
especially my wife, sons and daughter who have
always been a source of inspiration, encouragement
and energy to undertake my higher studies and
to face the eventualities of life with zeal,
enthusiasm and fear of
God.**

DECLARATION

I Rohail Ahmed S/O Najeeb Ullah Khan, a student of M. Phil. Political Science at the University of Management and Technology, Lahore hereby declare that this thesis entitled " **The Red Mosque Incident: A Comparative Framing Analysis in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)** " is the requirement for the degree of M. Phil. Political Science program. Furthermore, this work is entirely my own original effort. This work has not been previously submitted anywhere for any other degree or program.

Rohail Ahmed

Date: 31-10-2017

Research Completion Certificate from Supervisor

It is certified that the research work contained in this thesis titled: "**The Red Mosque Incident: A Comparative Framing Analysis in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)**" has been carried out and completed by Rohail Ahmed, ID No. 15004112005 under my supervision.

It is also certified that M. Phil. thesis of Rohail Ahmed, Roll No. 15004112005 on the topic "**The Red Mosque Incident: A Comparative Framing Analysis in the Coverage of Local Right Wing and Western Print Media (June – Aug 2007)**" is his original work and all the sources have been cited in accordance with the prescribed format. Its scope and significance warrant its acceptance to the Department of Political Science, UMT Lahore for the award of M. Phil. Degree in Political Science.

Dr. Fatima Sajjad

Assistant Professor, DPS

Date: 31-10-2017

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First of all, I am thankful to Allah Almighty, who gives us good health and ability to complete this work.

This project was made possible with the support of many people. I am thankful to my supervisor, Dr. Fatima Sajjad, who read my various revisions and her contribution in making my work is very valuable. She always encouraged me and her encouragement made it possible for me to carry out this research. She guided me at every stage of my research process.

I am grateful to the cooperative staff of Graduate Committee of Political Science Department at UMT.

I am very thankful to my friends especially Muhammad Ishaq, Sara Ahmed, Suman Saeed, Muhammad Arshad, Senior Teacher in Aitchison College, Lahore as well as my brother Sohail Ahmed and my family members who supported me during difficulties. They also provided me moral help through the entire period of my research.

Abstract

The purpose of this research is to analyze how a crucial incident of Pakistan's recent political history - the Red Mosque military operation of 2007 has been reported and narrated by selected Western and Local Right wing newspapers. How these media forums framed the news stories about the Red Mosque incident in their respective contexts. This incident is significant in Pakistani history, because a series of suicide bombings started after it. This study explains the news framing trends using framing analysis of Western and Pakistani Local Right wing media. At the first phase, Framing Analysis elucidates the language of the news stories of two factions through framing forms/tools which are based on rhetoric sense. Then, at second phase, comparative analysis technique elaborates the major frames of two newspapers. The study finds how various frames used by Pakistani Local Right wing media (The Daily Islam, The Daily Jasarat & The Takbeer Weekly) and selected Western media (The Guardian, The Washington Post & The Economist) to describe the story of the Red Mosque incident in 2007.

Key Words: Framing Analysis, Red Mosque incident , Extremism, Pakistani Media, Western Media.

Table of Contents

Dedication	I
Declaration	II
Research Completion Certificate	III
Acknowledgements	IV
Abstract	V
Table of Contents	VI
List of Tables	XII
1. Introduction	1
1.1 Historical Background	1
1.2 Theoretical Framework of this Study	7
1.3 Aim of the Study	8
1.4 Rationale of the Study	9
1.5 Research Questions	10
1.5.1 Main Research Question	10
1.5.1.1 Sub-questions	10
2. Literature Review	11
2.1 Perspective of the Red Mosque	11
2.2 The Incident	12
2.3 Connection between Talibans and the Red Mosque Administration	13
2.4 Illegal Activities of the Red Mosque Administration and Students	14

2.5 The Red Mosque Administration as a Symbol of Force and Violence	15
2.6 Weak Negotiating Policies of Government	15
2.7 Role of Print Media and the Red Mosque	16
2.8 Contribution into the Current Literature	17
2.9 Theoretical Framework	17
2.9.1 Social Constructivism	17
2.9.2 Framing Technique	18
2.9.3 Approaches of News Framing Analysis	20
2.9.4 Framing Effects	21
3. Methodology	23
3.1 The Framing and Data Analysis Research Design	23
3.2 Unit of Analysis	27
3.3 Setting	27
3.4 Quota Sampling	28
3.5 Data Collection/Documents	28
3.6 Local Right Wing Newspapers	29
3.6.1 The Daily Jasarat	29
3.6.2 The Daily Islam	30
3.6.3 The Weekly Takbeer	30
3.7 Western Print Media	30
3.7.1 The Guardian	30

3.7.2 The Economist	31
3.7.3 The Washington Post	31
3.8 Limitations	32
3.9 Ethical Consideration	32
4. Framing Analysis of Gen. Pervez Musharraf's Speech & Ume Hasaan's Narrative	34
4.1 Perspective of Gen. Pervez Musharraf's Speech	34
4.2 Frames of Gen. Pervez Musharraf Speech	35
4.3 Metaphor used	36
4.4 Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase used	37
4.5 Contrast used	38
4.6 Spin used	38
4.7 Story used	39
4.8 Conclusion of Speech	39
4.9 Perspective of Ume Hasaan Narrative	39
4.10 Frames of Ume Hasaan Narrative	40
4.11 Metaphor used	41
4.12 Slogan, Jargon, Catchphrase used	43
4.13 Contrast used	43
4.14 Spin used	43
4.15 Story used	43
4.16 Conclusion of Ume Hasaan's Narrative	43

4.17 Analysis of Two Accounts	44
5. Framing Analysis of The Local Right Wing Print Media about The Red Mosque Incident	46
5.1 Perspective of Local Right Wing Print Media	46
5.2 Frames of the Local Right Wing Print Media	47
5.3 Metaphor used in the Jasarat	48
5.4 Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase used in the Jasarat	49
5.5 Contrast used in the Jasarat	50
5.6 Spin used in the Jasarat	50
5.7 Story used in the Jasarat	51
5.8 Metaphor used in the Takbeer	51
5.9 Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase used in the Takbeer	52
5.10 Contrast used in the Takbeer	52
5.11 Spin used in the Takbeer	52
5.12 Story used in the Takbeer	53
5.13 Metaphor used in the Daily Islam	53
5.14 Contrast used in the Daily Islam	53
5.15 Spin used in the Daily Islam	54
5.16 Story used in the Daily Islam	54
5.17 Analysis of the Local Right Wing Print Media with Framing Language Forms	54
6. Framing Analysis of The Western Print Media about The Red Mosque Incident	56

6.1 Perspective of The Western Print Media	56
6.2 Frames of the Western Print Media	57
6.3 Metaphor used in the Economist	58
6.4 Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase used in the Economist	60
6.5 Contrast used in the Economist	61
6.6 Spin used in the Economist	61
6.7 Story used in the Economist	61
6.8 Metaphor used in the Guardian	62
6.9 Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase used in the Guardian	63
6.10 Contrast used in the Guardian	64
6.11 Spin used in the Guardian	64
6.12 Story used in the Guardian	64
6.13 Metaphor used in the Washington Post	65
6.14 Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase used in the Washington Post	66
6.15 Contrast used in the Washington Post	66
6.16 Spin used in the Washington Post	67
6.17 Story used in the Washington Post	67
6.18 Analysis of the Western Print Media with Framing Language Forms	67
7. Comparative Framing Analysis of The Local Right Wing and The Western Print Media	69
7.1 Detailed Comparative Analysis	76
7.2 Extremism Vs. Basic Right of Freedom	77

7.3 Legal Vs. Illegal Activities	78
7.4 Usage of the Red Mosque for Political Interests	80
7.5 Deep Links among Red Mosque Administrators and Terrorist Organizations	80
7.6 Efforts of Conciliation and Ghazi Abdul Rashid's Offer for Surrender	81
7.7 Unnoticed Frames by Western Media	82
Conclusion	83
References	85
Appendix A: Framing Chart	96
Appendix B: Story Analysis Forms	116
Appendix C: President Musharraf's address to nation over Lal Masjid	152
Appendix D: Booklet Copy of Ume Hasaan " Saneha Lal Masjid: Hum Pr Kiya Guzri"	

List of Tables

Table 1.1 Chronological Events of the Red Mosque (Dolnik & Iqbal, 2016)	5
Table 3.1 Classification of Frames (Semetko & Valkenburg, 2000)	23
Table 3.2 Language Forms of Fairhurst & Sarr (1996)	24
Table 3.3 Description of Story Analysis Form:	26
Table 3.4 Data Collection (Newspapers & Magazine wise Article Strength)	32
Table 4.1 Name of Frames	36
Table 4.2 Name of Metaphors	36
Table 4.3 Name of Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase	37
Table 4.4 Name of Frames	41
Table 4.5 Name of Metaphors	41
Table 5.1 Name of Frames	47
Table 5.2 Name of Metaphors	48
Table 5.3 Name of Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase	49
Table 5.4 Name of Metaphors	51
Table 5.5 Name of Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase	52
Table 6.1 Name of Frames	57
Table 6.2 Name of Metaphors	58
Table 6.3 Name of Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase	60
Table 6.4 Name of Metaphors	62
Table 6.5 Name of Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase	63
Table 6.6 Name of Metaphors	65
Table 6.7 Name of Slogan, Jargon, catchphrase	66
Table 7.1 Divergent Frames and Their Emerging Messages:	69
Table 7.2 Divergent Frames and Their Emerging Messages:	76

1. Introduction:

The U.S. led post 9/11 War on Terror left a lasting impact on multiple sections of Pakistani society. One sector which was most deeply affected by the multidimensional war was the traditional religious education in Pakistan. The Red Mosque and its affiliated seminaries were one of the most important institutions for religious education at the heart of Pakistani capital Islamabad. It was built in the early years of newly established capital of Pakistan. It had also long history in the perspective of Pakistani politics, Russo-Afghan war and War on Terror.