

**The Impact of Formal Feedback on the Development of
Writing Skills at O-Level in the Selected Private Schools in
Lahore**



Ana Ramsha

ID # 13014084028

M.Phil

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of M.Phil

Applied Linguistics

in

DEPARTMENT OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE

SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES AND HUMANITIES

UNIVERSITY OF MANAGEMENT AND TECHNOLOGY, LAHORE

2016

Abstract

This study explores the impact of teachers' written feedback on students' English composition writing in the selected private high schools in Lahore and also examines students' attitude towards teacher feedback. A mixed method approach was used to gather both qualitative and quantitative data through the use of survey questionnaires for both students and teachers and composition essays. The study took place during the regular school year in three O-Level classrooms. Research participants (n=75) were selected using random sampling. Small scale pilot study and Cronbach's Alpha test was conducted to ensure that the research would proceed as predicted and to test the validity and reliability of the data.

Closed ended questionnaires were triangulated by analyzing real classroom composition essays. Quantitative data were collected and analyzed using Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) and is presented using descriptive statistics with frequency and percentage of responses. The ESL composition profile constructed by Jacobs et al (1981) was used in the current research to examine the quality of learners' first draft and second draft based on the scores on accuracy, content, expression, vocabulary and mechanic features of essay writing. The scores of learners' essay quality were measured before the feedback (first draft) and after the feedback (second draft). Two unbiased raters were requested to read and grade students' first draft and second draft using ESL composition profile to examine the quality of essays based on their scores. A paired sample T-test was run to understand whether there was a significant difference between the first draft and the second draft.

Results of the paired sample T-Test showed that the scores given by the raters increased significantly in the second draft as compared to the first draft. Teachers' comments had a constructive impact on the writing quality of the learners and a positive improvement was noticed in their performance in their post-test stage as compared to their pre-test stage. This study revealed that students get assistance even from marginal feedback. Therefore, in the light of this study it is recommended that educational institutions should work on regulating feedback practices in Pakistan and integrating multiple draft strategies in order to maximize learning.

Key words: Teacher Feedback, O-Level, Multiple drafts, ESL Composition writing, academic achievement

Dedication

I dedicate this thesis to my wonderful mother Ghazala Khalid who made me who I am now. Her constant love, sacrifice, encouragement, endless prayers and support have sustained me throughout my life.

Acknowledgements

Above all, I would like to express my gratitude to Allah Almighty for all His blessings and mercy which enabled me to complete this thesis successfully. I sincerely appreciate and express my thanks to my supervisor Dr Nadia Anwar, an inspirational professor at the Department of English Language and Literature, University of Management and Technology Lahore for her invaluable guidance, encouragement, patience, and assistance in all stages of this research. Her helpful advice gave me the confidence to complete my degree. Without her support, appreciation and detailed feedback this study would not have been possible.

I would also like to express my heartfelt gratitude to Dr. Muhammad Shaban Rafi, the chairman of the Department of English Language and Literature, University of Management and Technology for providing help in every possible way during the entire period of this research dissertation. I am also very thankful to Mr. Furqan Tanveer, his contribution even though small, was very influential in shaping the direction of my research. I wish to express my thanks to my colleagues Shabana Fahim, Rabia Asim, Anum Zehra, and Rida Fatima who encouraged and supported me throughout this study.

I am very thankful to my parents, who always pray, support and encourage me. I would also like to thank my sister, Sheza, for her exemplary support, for believing in me and for giving me strength when I needed it the most. I am also very grateful to my brother Nashit Mueez for driving me all over the town to schools, photocopiers, university and various other research locations. It is my family's never ending love, support and guidance that I could finally materialize my dream to get an MPhil degree.

I am also very grateful to the students and respected teachers of private high schools of Lahore for their cooperation and participation in this research study and for providing me with the documents I needed to analyze and complete this research.

Finally, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to all those who helped me in numerous ways during the course of this research dissertation.

Table of Contents

Abstract	i
Dedication	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Table of Contents	iv
List of Appendices	vii
List of Tables	viii
List of Figures	ix
List of Abbreviations	ix
Chapter 1: Introduction: Feedback a Significant Pedagogical Tool	1
Overview	1
1.1 Education System in Pakistan	1
1.1.1 Secondary Education System in Pakistan	3
1.1.2 Cambridge Education System in Pakistan	3
1.1.3 Importance of Four Basic English Language Skills	4
1.1.4 Writing difficulties faced by O-Level Students	5
1.1.5 Feedback in Instructional Context	6
1.1.6 Purpose of Feedback in the Process of Teaching	6
1.1.7 Hand Written Comments on (or about) Students' Work	8
1.2 Aim of the Study	9
1.3 Objectives of the Study	9
1.4 Statement of the Problem	9
1.5 Research Questions	10
1.6 Implications of the Study	11
1.7 Limitation of the Study	11
1.8 Chapter Division	11

Summary	12
Chapter 2 Literature Review: Learning Theories about Feedback	13
Overview	13
2.1 Understanding Feedback: A Learning Theory Perspective	13
2.2 Effectiveness or Ineffectiveness of Feedback: A Debate	16
2.3 Feedback in the Teaching of ESL Writing	18
2.3.1 Models for Understanding Student Writing	20
2.3.2 Analyses of Feedback Comments	21
2.4 Roles of Instructor in Delivering Feedback on Student Essay	23
2.5 Multiple Draft Revisions	24
2.6 Written Feedback with Remedial Comments	26
2.7 Student and Tutor Perceptions of Feedback	27
Summary	28
Chapter 3 Research Methodology	32
Overview	32
3.1 Research Design	32
3.1.1 Adapting a Framework	33
3.2 Sample and Demographics	35
3.3 Data Collection Methods	36
3.3.1 Questionnaire	38
3.3.2 Multiple Draft Essays	38
3.4 Ethical Considerations	39
3.4.1 Informed Consent	39
3.5 Data Analysis Techniques	40
Summary	41

Chapter 4 Data Analysis and Discussion	42
Overview	42
4.1 Students' Attitude towards Writing Skills	42
4.2 Impact of Feedback on Writing Skills	43
4.2.1 Post-Feedback Actions.....	50
4.3 Analysis of Composition Essays.....	52
4.4 Error Analysis	54
4.4.1 Impact on Grammar	55
4.4.2 Impact on Mechanics	57
4.4.3 Impact on Language Use	58
4.4.4 Frequency of Errors between Two Drafts.....	59
4.5 Discussion	60
Summary	63
Chapter 5 Conclusion	64
Overview	64
5.1 Key Findings	64
5.2 Contribution of the study	65
5.3 Limitations faced during the Research	66
5.4 Recommendations for Future Research	68
5.5 Post-Research Implications of the Study	68
Summary	69
References	71
Appendices.....	83

List of Appendices

Appendix A:	Research information sheets and consent forms	83
Appendix A1:	Research Information sheet: School Principal	83
Appendix A2:	Consent of Participation: School Principal	85
Appendix A3:	Research Information sheet: Research Participants	86
Appendix A4:	Informed Consent of Participation: Research Participants	87
Appendix B:	Survey Questionnaires	88
Appendix B1:	Student Questionnaire.....	88
Appendix B2:	Teacher Questionnaire.....	91
Appendix C:	ESL Composition Profile by Jacobs et al (1981).....	94
Appendix D:	Sample Composition Essays.....	95
Appendix D1:	Sample Composition Essay 1.....	95
Appendix D2:	Sample Composition Essay 2.....	101
Appendix D3:	Sample Composition Essay 3.....	106
Appendix D4:	Sample Composition Essay 4.....	112
Appendix D5:	Sample Composition Essay 5.....	116

List of Tables

Table 1: Profile of the teacher participants	35
Table 2: Profile of the student participants	36
Table 3: Perceptions of students about writing tasks	43
Table 4: Cronbach Alpha Reliability Statistics	43
Table 5: Survey question number 4 descriptive statistics	44
Table 6: Survey question number 14 descriptive statistics	44
Table 7: Survey question number 11 descriptive statistics.....	45
Table 8: Survey question number 5 descriptive statistics.....	45
Table 9 Survey question number 1 descriptive statistics	46
Table 10 Survey question number 2 descriptive statistics	46
Table 11 Survey question number 3 descriptive statistics	47
Table 12 Survey question number 15 descriptive statistics	47
Table 13 Survey question number 8 descriptive statistics	48
Table 14 Survey question number 9 descriptive statistics	48
Table 15 Survey question number 10 descriptive statistics	49
Table 16 Teachers' Survey questions descriptive statistics.....	49
Table 17 Survey question number 12 descriptive statistics	50
Table 18 Survey question number 13 descriptive statistics	51
Table 19 Survey question number 19 descriptive statistics	51
Table 20 Survey question number 20 descriptive statistics	52
Table 21 Paired Sample T-test result on difference of marks.....	53
Table 22 Descriptive statistics on errors in grammar	55
Table 23 Paired sample T-test on difference of grammatical errors.....	56
Table 24 Samples of Grammatical Errors.....	56
Table 25 Descriptive statistics on errors in mechanics.....	57
Table 26 Paired sample T-test on difference of mechanical errors	57
Table 27 Samples of Errors in Mechanics	58
Table 28 Descriptive statistics on errors in language use.....	58
Table 29 Samples of Errors in Language use	59

Table 30 Descriptive statistics on frequency of errors between both drafts	60
Table 31 Paired sample T-test on frequency of errors between both drafts	60

List of Figures

Figure 1: Outline of the research procedure	37
Figure 2: Essay writing and feedback stages	39
Figure 3: Frequency of errors	54

List of Abbreviations

ESL	English as a Second Language
SPSS	Statistical Package for the Social Sciences
O-Level	Ordinary Level
ELT	English Language Teaching
MA	Master of Arts
GCE	General Certificate of Education
SSC	Secondary School Certificate
UK	United Kingdom
CIE	Cambridge International Examinations

Introduction

Feedback a Significant Pedagogical Tool

Overview

The present research examines the impact of teachers' hand written feedback on English composition writing at O-Level in the selected private high schools of Lahore. This chapter covers the aim of the study, objectives, implications and limitations of the study. It further indicates the statement of problem and research questions to be treated in the coming chapters.

1.1 Education System in Pakistan

English is spoken and used in all parts of the world. Its presence is felt in all fields of knowledge including arts, science and the humanities. English is a medium of worldwide communication, education and better professional opportunities. That is why teaching English in the institutions as a second language is essential in a helpful way to attain the required goals and purposes at domestic and international levels.

Acquiring English language is hardly an unconscious procedure for the Pakistani ESL students. The students experience very rare occasions to grasp English from the natural setting to attain a native impression for an accurate language structure and expressions in diverse settings of usage in educational and community scenarios. Therefore, the one in question are not the students who do not have the ability to study but the entire educational system that requires overhauling. The students, thus, should be given proper teachers' feedback to aid them study English as a second language.