

# **Decline of Public Schools in Punjab and Strategies for their Revival**



**Syed Nasir Hussain Shah**

**ID# 101093001**

**DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION  
SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES AND HUMANITIES  
University of Management and Technology  
Lahore**

**2017**

# **Decline of Public Schools in Punjab and Strategies for their Revival**



**Syed Nasir Hussain Shah**  
**ID# 101093001**

**A thesis submitted in partial fulfillments of the requirements  
for the degree of PhD in Education in the Department of  
Education**

**School of Social Sciences and Humanities  
University of Management and Technology  
Lahore**

**2017**



## **Author's Declaration**

I, **Syed Nasir Hussain Shah**, hereby state that my PhD thesis entitled “**Decline of Public Schools in Punjab and Strategies for Their Revival**” is my own work and has not been submitted previously by me for taking any degree from this university

**University of Management and Technology, Lahore**

or anywhere else in the country/world.

At any time if my statement is found to be incorrect even after my Graduation, the University has the right to withdraw my PhD degree.

---

Syed Nasir Hussain Shah

Date: \_\_\_\_\_



## **Plagiarism Undertaking**

I solemnly declare that research work presented in the thesis titled “**Decline of Public Schools in Punjab and Strategies for Their Revival**” is solely my research work with no significant contribution from any other person. Small contribution/help wherever taken has been duly acknowledged and that complete thesis has been written by me. I understand the zero tolerance policy of the HEC and the university

### **University of Management and Technology, Lahore**

towards plagiarism. Therefore I, as an Author of the above titled thesis, declare that no portion of my thesis has been plagiarized and any material used as reference is properly referred / cited.

I undertake that if I am found guilty of any formal plagiarism in the above titled thesis even after award of PhD degree, the university reserves the right to withdraw/revoke my PhD degree and that HEC and the University has the right to publish my name on the HEC/University Website on which names of students are placed who submitted plagiarized thesis.

---

Syed Nasir Hussain Shah

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

## Certificate of Approval

This is to certify that the research work presented in this thesis, entitled “**Decline of Public Schools in Punjab and Strategies for their Revival**” was conducted by Mr. **Syed Nasir Hussain Shah** under the supervision of **Dr. Abdul Hameed**.

No part of this thesis has been submitted anywhere else for any other degree. This thesis is submitted to the Department of Education in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the field of Education, Department of Education, University of Management and Technology, Lahore.

Student Name: Syed Nasir Hussain Shah

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

Examination Committee:

a) External Examiner 1: Dr. Iftikhar Ahmed Baig

Dean, University of Lahore,

Lahore

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

b) External Examiner 2: Dr. Nabi Bux Jumani

Dean, International Islamic University,

Islamabad

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

c) Internal Examiner:

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

Prof. Dr. Abdul Hameed (Supervisor)

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

Dr. Seema Arif (Head of the Department)

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

## **CERTIFICATE**

It is to certify that the research work described in this PhD dissertation entitled “Decline of Public Schools in Punjab and Strategies for their Revival” is the original work of the author and has been carried out under my direct supervision. I have personally gone through all its data, contents and results reported in the manuscript. Furthermore, to the best of my knowledge, all the data collected and analyzed are genuine and original. I further certify that the material included in the thesis has not been used partially or fully, in any manuscript already submitted or is in the process of submission in partial or complete fulfillment of the award of any other degree from any institution. I also certify that the thesis has been developed under my supervision according to the prescribed format and I endorse its evaluation for the award of PhD degree in accordance with the prescribed procedure of the university.

---

Supervisor  
Dr. Abdul Hameed  
Professor and Dean  
School of Social Sciences and Humanities  
University of Management and Technology  
Lahore

## ABSTRACT

The government of Pakistan has legal bindings and international commitments to provide education to its each and every citizen irrespective of gender, caste, creed, and race. Public school system in Pakistan works under the auspices of federal, provincial, and district governments, and offer education to masses. There are sufficient empirical evidences to support the idea that public schools have been experiencing a declining trend on different indicators like quality of students' learning and outputs, enrolments of students, and parent dissatisfaction, etc. During discussions with experts and informed stakeholders, it was identified that public schools in Punjab are declining due to some social, governmental, and school related problems. This study was held to investigate the in-school factors which resulted decline of public schools in Punjab. The main objective of the study was to identify school-related problems of public schools in Punjab (Pakistan) and then propose strategies for the revival of these schools.

Four main stakeholders of schooling i.e. the head teachers, teachers, parents, and students made the population of the study. Multi-stage sampling technique was used to select the sample from the population. To select a representative sample, 36 districts of Punjab were distributed in three strata on the basis of their educational indicators and two districts from each stratum were selected randomly. In the next stage, one tehsil from each district was randomly selected. Six secondary or higher secondary schools were conveniently selected from each tehsil to select the respondents for the study. In this way, the valid responses of 36 head teachers, 263 teachers, 282 parents, and 802 students from public schools were received for the study. A semi-structured interview protocol regarding school governance and management was developed for the head teachers; a job satisfaction scale was adapted

for the teachers; a structured interview was developed to measure parents' satisfaction with public schools; and school learning environment scale was developed for students of public schools. The research instruments were validated by experts and then pilot tested.

The study found that the schools faced scarcity of funds to improve teaching learning process. Furthermore, the head teachers had no real administrative authority and their too heavy administrative duties were detrimental to their role as instructional leader. The head teachers were not satisfied with their promotion policy, monitoring and accountability mechanism, working relationship with district administration, and the competency building trainings. The teachers also showed their dissatisfaction with their service structure and working environment of the public schools. The parents were not satisfied with the quality of teaching and role of schools in overall personality development of their children. The students, parents, and head teachers agreed that there was lack of communication between school and parents. Furthermore, almost all of them agreed that physical and learning facilities were available but not properly utilized.

On the basis of the findings of the study, strategies were suggested to revive public schools in Punjab (Pakistan). The major suggestion in the proposed strategies focus on increasing budget for schools, financial and administrative empowerment of head teachers, changes in service structure of head teachers and teachers, improve quality of teaching, effective utilization of physical and learning resources, communication between school and parents, and activate community participation.

**THIS WORK IS DEDICATED TO**

**All out-of-school children of Pakistan**

**These are Millions of broken promises**

**These are Millions of shattered dreams**

## Acknowledgements

All praises to Allah, the Almighty, who bestowed upon me intellect, strength and courage to complete this work. His mercy is such that unworthy man like me has worked for the cause of knowledge and education. I have the most exalted feelings of being the follower of the greatest man ever – the Holy Prophet Muhammad SAW who is also the greatest teacher of humanity. May Allah SWT give us all the ability to follow his teachings and *seerah*.

This study could only be completed with the scholarly guidance and kind help of **Prof. Dr. Abdul Hameed** who not only extended his scholarly help but provided moral support also. I found him a great teacher, a committed researcher and a sympathetic human being. Rather than leading, he let me grow. I am also thankful to Dr. Zafar Iqbal, Dr. Khushi Muhammad and other faculty members of the department.

This study and I owe a lot to Dr. Mushtaq Malik, Dr. Zubair Shah and Mirza Muhammad Aslam. Sincere regards for Dr. Nasir Mehmood, Dr. Shamim Haider Tirmazi, Dr. Saima Batool and Dr. Shafqat Hussain. Very special thanks to my fellows for their peer support and guidance: Akhtar Hussain, Dr. Hina Munir, Muhammad Rafique, Javed Qadir, Maala Hussain, Joseph Faheem, Mr. & Mrs. Hifzur Rehman, Lubna Shah, Muhammad Zubair, Imran Niazi, Lubna Chaurdhry and Sufia Sultana. I am also thankful to the principal and all of my colleagues. But the most significant and substantial contribution to this research work came from Dr. Asia Zulfqar. Her moral and intellectual support kept me moving all the way. Despite her very busy life as a PhD student at a prestigious international university, she was always there to help me.

I want to mention my gratitude to all those experts who spared time and granted their expert opinions in validating research tools and strategic plan; research

assistants who helped me during data collection; and all head teachers, teachers, parents and students who participated in the study. I am also thankful to lab and library staff of UMT, Rafique Awan (CLO) and Kashif Shehzad from Dean Office.

Perhaps no words can express my gratitude to my affectionate uncle Dr. Syed Walayat Ali, younger brother Dr. Syed Ahmed Mansoor, supporting sisters, caring wife, lovable son Muhammad Raffay, the sweet angels Afsheen Fatima Hussain and Asmarah Zainab Hussain. I intentionally saved last words for my parents who have been the greatest inspiration for me since my childhood. They are so selfless that I can't even thank them. They never let me worry about anything in my life. I am just because of you – my dear parents; love you!

Hussain

## Tables of Contents

Chapter	Topic	Page
<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
	Statement of the Problem	9
	Objectives of the Study	9
	Research Questions	10
	Significance of the Study	10
	Hypothetical Framework of the Study	11
	Delimitation of the Study	16
<b>2</b>	<b>Review of the Related Literature</b>	<b>17</b>
	Development of Education in Pakistan	18
	Issues and Problems of Education System in Pakistan	20
	Emergence of Private Sector	23
	Latest Educational Policies (1998 and 2009)	27
	Education For All & Millennium Development Goals; Targets and Realities	28
	Causes of School Decline	31
	Meager Public Spending	35
	Low Educational Outputs	38
	Ineffective Human Resource Development	39
	No Community Participation and Parents' Involvement	41
	Parents' Dissatisfaction	42
	Non-Conducive Learning Environment	44
	Lack of Physical and Learning Facilities	47
	Poor Leadership and Management	50

	Low Quality of Teaching and Teaching Staff	54
	Low Level of Teachers’ Job Satisfaction	57
	Summary	60
<b>3</b>	<b>Research Methodology and Procedure</b>	<b>61</b>
	Research Design	61
	Procedure of the Study	62
	Population of the Study	62
	Sampling	63
	Research Instruments	70
	Development of Research Instruments	71
	School Governance and Management Interview Protocol	71
	Job Satisfaction Scale	72
	Parents’ Satisfaction Scale	74
	School Learning Environment Scale	75
	Validation of Research Instruments	76
	Pilot Testing of Research Instruments	77
	Reliability of Research Instruments	77
	Data Collection	78
	Data Analysis	79
	Development and Validation of Proposed Strategies	80
<b>4</b>	<b>Data Analysis</b>	<b>82</b>
	Analysis of Head Teachers’ Perceptions regarding School Management and Governance	83
	Analysis of Teachers’ Job Satisfaction Scale	112
	Analysis of Parents’ Satisfaction Scale	139

	Analysis of Students' Perceptions regarding School Learning Environment	158
<b>5</b>	<b>Summary, Findings, Conclusions, Discussion, Strategies</b>	<b>179</b>
	Summary	179
	Findings	180
	School Governance and Management	180
	Teachers' Job Satisfaction	185
	Parents' Satisfaction	193
	School Learning Environment	199
	Conclusions	205
	Discussion	212
	Proposed Strategies for Revival of Public schools in Punjab	224
	Implications for further Researches	265
	<b>References</b>	<b>267</b>
	<b>Appendices</b>	<b>301</b>

---

## List of Tables

Table No.	Title	Page
1.1	Government spending on education in terms of GDP	4
1.2	Punjab education budget analyses	4
1.3	Statistics about private education institutions	6
1.4	Distribution of factors causing decline of public schools in Punjab	12
2.1	Access and quality issues in education and strategies for improvement	22
2.2	Punjab: Issues/challenges and suggested solution	29
2.3	Province wise budgetary allocations for current and development expenditures (Rs. in millions)	37
2.4	Education total budgetary allocations and expenditures (Rs in millions)	38
3.1	Representative districts for sampling	66
3.2	Selection of Tehsils	67
3.3	Response rate of head teachers, teachers, parents, and students	70
3.4	List of instruments, purposes, and respondents	71
3.5	Factor-wise reliability analysis of Job Satisfaction Scale	77
3.6	Factor-wise reliability analysis of School Learning Environment Scale	78
4.1.1	Academic and professional qualifications of the head teachers	83

---

4.1.2	Teaching and administrative experience of the head teachers	84
4.2.1	Gender and locality of teachers	113
4.2.2	Academic qualification and pay of the teachers	113
4.2.3	Teachers' perception about school environment	114
4.2.4	Teachers' perception about head teacher's behavior	116
4.2.5	Teachers' perception about colleagues' behavior	117
4.2.6	Teachers' perception about job itself	118
4.2.7	Teachers' perception about pay and allowances	119
4.2.8	Teachers' perception about teaching / work activities	121
4.2.9	Teachers' perception about job security and service structure	122
4.2.10	Teachers' perception about physical facilities / working conditions	123
4.2.11	Teachers' perceptions about factors contributing towards their low level of job satisfaction	125
4.2.12	Teachers' suggestions for improving their job satisfaction	127
4.2.13	Teachers' perceptions about causes of decline of public schools	128
4.2.14	t test for mean difference on the basis of gender	130
4.2.15	t test for mean difference on the basis of locality	131
4.2.16	One way ANOVA on teaching experience	133
4.2.17	Post hoc LSD test for teaching experience	134
4.2.18	One way ANOVA on pay	135
4.2.19	Post hoc LSD test for pay	136
4.4.20	One way ANOVA on academic qualification	137

---

---

4.3.1	Distribution of parents on basis of monthly income	139
4.3.2	Distribution of fathers' and mothers' occupation	140
4.3.3	Distribution of fathers' and mothers' qualification	140
4.3.4	Causes of parents' preference of public schools	141
4.3.5	Parents' opinion about communication from schools	142
4.3.6	Parents' confidence in schools in communicating extraordinary affairs	143
4.3.7	Parents' perception regarding response of visits to their children's schools	143
4.3.8	Parents' perceptions regarding teachers' dedication and efforts	144
4.3.9	Homework given by the teacher	144
4.3.10	Amount of homework	145
4.3.11	Parents' perception about feedback on homework	145
4.3.12	Parents' opinion about use of modern teaching techniques at schools	146
4.3.13	Parents' perception regarding teachers' emphasis on understanding the concept	147
4.3.14	Students' praise for their teachers	147
4.3.15	Availability of clean toilets at school	148
4.3.16	Availability of clean drinking water at school	149
4.3.17	Availability and utilization of playground at school	149
4.3.18	Availability and utilization of library at school	150
4.3.19	Availability and utilization of computer lab at school	150
4.3.20	Availability and utilization of science lab at school	151

---

---

4.3.21	Parents' perception about condition of school building	152
4.3.22	Parents' perception about learning environment of the school	152
4.3.23	Parents' perception regarding role of school in the personality development of their children	154
4.3.24	Parents' satisfaction with schools regarding educational achievements of their children	155
4.3.25	Parents' perception about causes of tuition or no tuition	156
4.3.26	Overall parent satisfaction with public schools	157
4.4.1	Distribution of students on the basis of gender and locality	158
4.4.2	Distribution of students on their family monthly income	159
4.4.3	Frequency distribution of father's and mothers' education	160
4.4.4	Analysis of statements regarding interaction and communication	161
4.4.5	Analysis of statements regarding instructional tools and methodologies	163
4.4.6	Analysis of statements regarding physical environment	165
4.4.7	Analysis of restricted response suggestion to improve the school	166
4.4.8	Analysis of open ended suggestion to improve the school	167
4.4.9	t test by gender on SLES and its factors	168
4.4.10	t test by locality on SLES and its factors	169
4.4.11	One-way ANOVA on father qualification	170
4.4.12	Post hoc LSD test for father's education	171
4.4.13	One-way ANOVA on father occupation	172

---

---

4.4.14	One-way ANOVA on mother education	173
4.4.15	One-way ANOVA on mother occupation	174
4.4.16	Post hoc LSD test for SLES and interaction and communication	175
4.4.17	One-way ANOVA on family income	176
4.4.18	Post hoc LSD test for SLES and ‘interaction and communication’	177
5.1	Opinions about the proposed strategies	248

---

## List of Figures

<b>Figure No.</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Page</b>
1.1	Hypothetical framework of the study	16
3.1	Sampling flowchart	69
4.1	Distribution of teachers on basis of job experience	112
5.1	Deficiencies in public school system	227
5.2	Structure of Academy for Instruction and Management	234
5.3	Flow diagram of proposed strategies for revival of public schools in Punjab	246

## **Abbreviations and Key Terms**

CPD	Continuous Professional Development
DAO	District Account Office
DEO (SE)	District Education Officer (Secondary Education)
DSD	Directorate of Staff Development
EDO	Executive District Officer
EFA	Education for All
ESE	Elementary School Educator
EST	Elementary School Teacher
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
KPK	Khyber Pakhton Khaw
LEAPS	Learning and Educational Achievements in Punjab Schools
LSD	Least Significant Difference
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MNAs	Members of National Assembly
MPAs	Members of Provincial Assembly
NEP	National Education Policy
PEC	Punjab Examination Commission
PKR	Pakistan Rupee
PSLM	Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement
PST	Primary School Teacher
SD	Standard Deviation
SESE	Senior Elementary School Educator
SS	Subject Specialist
SSE	Secondary School Educator

SSS	Senior Subject Specialist
SST	Secondary School Teacher
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

**Public schools:** The schools which are financed by and under direct control of Government of the Punjab. Public schools are also called government schools and both terms are used interchangeably in this report

**Secondary / High Schools:** The Public schools which offer 9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> grade education. Mostly such schools start their intake from 6<sup>th</sup> grade and some of the schools start their intake from 1<sup>st</sup> grade

**Higher Secondary Schools:** The Public schools which offer 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> grade along with the high school grades. The intake of these schools starts from 6<sup>th</sup> grade and in some cases, it starts from 1<sup>st</sup> grade.

# Chapter 1

## Introduction

Education is no longer considered as a 'privilege'. In the beginning, the sole purpose of education was to inculcate a set of moral values among a few selected people. 'Social skills' remained the only objective of education but the industrial revolution in Europe affected every aspect of human culture and civilization. Developing the skills for earning bread and butter got more importance than before. Education turned into one of the basic human rights. The states were explicitly held responsible for the provision of education to all its citizens. Like any other country in the world, the Constitution of Pakistan proclaims 'education' as one of the basic needs of the citizens like food, housing, clothing, and medical facilities and the state is held responsible for providing "basic necessities to its each and every citizen irrespective of sex, caste, creed, and race" (Article, 38-d). Section 25(a) of the Constitution declares that the state shall provide free and compulsory education to all children from age 6 to 16. The article 37(b) of the Constitution of Pakistan binds the government to "remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory secondary education within possible period." Furthermore, Pakistan is also a signatory of Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and in pursuance of achieving MDGs, the governments are bound to 'ensure that all boys and girls complete a full course of primary schooling' (UNDP, 2000).