

**An evaluation of assessment tools for secondary level English language  
classes of all bises of Punjab: a cognitive approach**

---



**Muhammad Ali**

**UMT ID: 14015084001**

**M. Phil.**

---

**DEPARTMENT OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE**

**SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES AND HUMANITIES**

**UNIVERSITY OF MANAGEMENT AND TECHNOLOGY**

**2017**

## **Dedication**

I dedicate this document to my parents and family.

## **Acknowledgements**

I would like to extend my profound gratitude to my research supervisor Prof. Rao Jaleel Ahmad for his feedback, guidance and support that enabled me to conclude this research endeavor. I also owe deep sense of thanks to the Head of Department of English Language and Literature Prof. Muhammad Shaban Rafi for his soft support that made it possible for me to get the things done.

I am extremely grateful to Mr. Zia-Ur-Rehman and Mr. Waqar Ahmad who spared their precious time and helped me in data analysis for this study.

I am also indebted to my family for their continuous support that provided me courage to take the final leap and complete this research study.

## **Abstract**

The present study aims to investigate the quality of the assessment tools of English administered by BISEs in Punjab for the award of Secondary School Certificate. These assessment tools serve as sole criteria to assess the learning of the students, therefore, their quality affects the quality of learning of the students and they have potential wash back effect on the system of education. A mixed method research design was adopted in the present study. The English language assessment tools for secondary classes of all BISEs of Punjab were evaluated with reference to the levels of cognitive domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy. Three raters rated the test items of these assessment tools using a rubric based on action words for each level of cognitive domain with the help of frequency tables. The consolidated data was analyzed for determining inter-rater reliability and frequency distribution along with frequency percentage. The analysis of the data revealed that most of the test items of the assessment tools were based on lower order thinking abilities and skills. The study could be beneficial for the improvement of assessment tools of English language for secondary classes of BISEs which, in turn, may lead to the improvement of the learning of the students and the education system at large.

## Table of Contents

<b>Chapter One</b>	<b>1</b>
Introduction	1
1.1 Chapter Overview	1
1.2 Background of the Study	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1.2.1 Secondary education in Pakistan	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1.2.2 Large scale examination bodies.	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1.2.3 English language teaching in Pakistan	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1.2.4 Proficiency of students in English	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1.2.5 English language education in Punjab-major initiatives	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
<b>defined.</b>	
1.3 Critical Issue	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1.4 Purpose of the Study	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1.5 Statement of the Problem	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1. 6 Objectives of the Study	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1.7 Research Questions	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1.8 Significance of the Study	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1.9 Research Methodology	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1.10 Delimitations of the Study	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
1.11 Summary	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>

<b>Chapter Two</b>	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Review of Related Literature	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.1 Chapter Overview	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.2 Educational Assessment	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.3 Role of Assessment in Education	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.3.1 Formative assessment	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.3.2 Summative assessment	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.3.3 Diagnostic assessment	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.3.4 Assessment and instruction	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.3.5 Assessment and learning	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.3.6 Assessment and curriculum	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.3.7 Assessment and language learning	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4 Assessment Approaches	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4.1 Traditional assessment approach	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4.1.1 Characteristic of traditional assessment approach	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4.1.2 Examinations	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4.1.3 Tests	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4.2 Alternative assessment approaches	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>

2.4.2.1 Characteristics of alternative assessment approach	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4.2.2 Authentic assessment	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4.2.3 Performance assessment	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.4.2.4 Constructivist assessment	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.5 Diversity in Assessment Practices	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.5.1 Classroom assessment	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.5.2 Examinations	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.5.3 Large-scale assessments	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.5.4 Assessment practices in South Asia	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.5.5 Assessment practices in Pakistan	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.5.5.1 Boards of intermediate and secondary education	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.5.5.2 Characteristics of secondary school examinations of BISEs	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6 Approaches to Learning	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.1 Behaviorist approach to learning	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.2 Humanistic approach to learning	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.3 Cognitive approach to learning	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.4 Cognitive orientations in educational taxonomies	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.4.1 Bloom's taxonomy	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>

2.6.4.1.1 Levels of Bloom’s taxonomy-cognitive domain	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.4.1.2 Bloom’s taxonomy and assessment	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.5 SOLO (Structure of observed learning outcomes) taxonomy	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.6 Fink’s taxonomy of significant learning	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.7 Revised Bloom’s taxonomy	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.7.1 Levels of Revised Bloom’s taxonomy	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.7.2 Lower order thinking skills (LOTS) and higher order thinking skills (HOTS)	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.6.8 Application of Bloom’s taxonomy and its revised version in different studies	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
2.7 Summary	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
<b>Chapter Three</b>	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Research Methodology	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.1 Chapter Overview	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.2 Research Design	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.3 Population of the study	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.4 Sample of the Study	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.5 Data Collection	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.6 Sampling Technique	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>

3.7 Research Instrument	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.8 Nature of Data	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.9 Coding of the Data	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.10 Consolidation of Quantified Data	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.11 Piloting of Research Design	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.12 Data Analysis	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.12.1 Inter-rater reliability analysis	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.12.2 Frequency distribution and frequency percentage	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.13 Ethical Consideration	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
3.14 Summary	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
<b>Chapter Four</b>	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Data Analysis	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
4.1 Chapter Overview	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
4.2 Results of Piloting Phase	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
4.3 Results	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
4.3.1 Inter-rater reliability analysis	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
4.3.2 Frequency distribution and percentage frequency	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
4.4 Summary	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
<b>Chapter Five</b>	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Findings, Discussion and Conclusion	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>

5.1 Chapter Overview	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
5.2 Key Findings	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
5.3 Discussion	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
5.4 Contribution of the study	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
5.5 Direction for Future Research	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
5.6 Conclusion	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
References	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
Appendix A	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
Appendix B	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
Appendix C	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
Personal Communication with Dr. Claudia Stanny	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>

### List of Tables

<b>Table 1</b> Description of Examination System of South Asian Countries	150
<b>Table 2</b> Test Items Processing Summary (Absolute Agreement and Consistency)	74
<b>Table 3</b> Inter-Item Correlation Matrix (Absolute Agreement and Consistency)	75
<b>Table 4</b> Description of Statistical Analysis of Intraclass Correlation Coefficient (ICC) for Absolute Agreement	75
<b>Table 5</b> Description of Statistical Analysis of Intraclass Correlation Coefficient (ICC) for Consistency	76
<b>Table 6</b> Test Items Processing Summary (Absolute Agreement and Consistency)	77
<b>Table 7</b> Inter-Item Correlation Matrix (Absolute Agreement and Consistency) for Entire Sample	77
<b>Table 8</b> Description of Statistical Analysis of Intraclass Correlation Coefficient (ICC) Absolute Agreement for Entire Sample	78
<b>Table 9</b> Description of Statistical Analysis of Intraclass Correlation Coefficient (ICC)	

Consistency for Entire Sample	79
<b>Table 10</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language classes of all BISEs of Punjab according to Levels of Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom’s Taxonomy	80
<b>Table 11</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language classes of all BISEs of Punjab for Year 2011 according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom’s Taxonomy	83
<b>Table 12</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language classes of all BISEs of Punjab for Year 2012 according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom’s Taxonomy	85
<b>Table 13</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language classes of all BISEs of Punjab for Year 2013 according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom’s Taxonomy	86
<b>Table 14</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language classes of all BISEs of Punjab for Year 2014 according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom’s Taxonomy	88
<b>Table 15</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language classes of all BISEs of Punjab for Year 2015 according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom’s Taxonomy	90

<b>Table 16</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools of BISE Bahawalpur according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy	93
<b>Table 17</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools of BISE DG Khan according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy	95
<b>Table 18</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools of BISE Faisalabad according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy	97
<b>Table 19</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools of BISE Gujranwala according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy	98
<b>Table 20</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools of BISE Lahore according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy	100
<b>Table 21</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools of BISE Multan according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy	102
<b>Table 22</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools of BISE Rawalpindi according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy	103

<b>Table 23</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools of BISE Sahiwal according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy	105
<b>Table 24</b> Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools of BISE Sargodha according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy	106

### List of Figures

<b>Figure 1</b> Description of Bloom's Taxonomy and its Revised Version	55
<b>Figure 2</b> Descriptions of LOTS and HOTS	56
<b>Figure 3</b> Description of the Research Design of the Study	67
<b>Figure 4</b> Comparison of <i>Frequency Distribution and Percentage Analysis of Test Items of Grade IX –X Assessment tools of English of all BISEs of Punjab according to Levels of Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy</i>	82
<b>Figure 5</b> Comparison of Frequency Distribution of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools for years 2011-15 of all BISEs according to cognitive domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy. The numbers in the figure show the number of test items of each year's test items as related with levels of cognitive domain as listed on the right side of the figure	91

**Figure 6** Comparison of Frequency Distribution of Test Items for Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools for years 2011 to 2015 of all BISEs according to LOTS and HOTS. The numbers in the figure show the number of test items of each year as related with both LOTS and HOTS as listed on the right side of the figure 92

**Figure 7** Comparison of Frequency Distribution of Test Items of Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools of All BISEs according to Cognitive Domain of Revised Bloom’s Taxonomy 108

**Figure 8** Comparison of Frequency Distribution of Test Items of Secondary Level English Language Assessment tools of All BISEs according to LOTS and HOTS 110

### **List of Acronyms**

AERA	American Education Research Association
APA	American Psychological Association
ASCD	Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development
BISE	Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education
CUTLA	Center for University Teaching, Learning and Assessment
EF EFI	Education First English Proficiency Index
FBISE	Federal Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education
HOCS	Higher Order Cognitive Skills
HOTS	Higher Order Thinking Skills
HSSC	Higher Secondary School Certificate
IBCC	Inter-Board Committee of Chairmen

ICC	Intraclass Correlation Coefficient
LOCS	Lower Order Cognitive Skills
LOTS	Lower Order Thinking Skills
MS	Microsoft
NCERT	National Council for Educational Research and Training
NCME	National Council on Measurement and Evaluation
NEAS	National Education Assessment System
PEAS	Provincial Education Assessment System
PISA	Program for International Student Assessment
RTE	Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education
SOLO	Structure of Observed Learning Outcomes
SPSS	Statistical Package for Social Sciences
SSC	Secondary School Certificate
TIMSS	Trends in Mathematics and Science Study
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

### **List of Operational Definitions**

**Assessment tools:** Question papers administered by BISEs for the award of Secondary School Certificate.

**Lower order thinking skills:** The lower three levels of cognitive domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy, that is, *remember*, *understand* and *apply*.

**Higher order thinking skills:** The higher three levels of cognitive domain of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy, that is, *analyze*, *evaluate* and *create*.

**Secondary Level Classes:** Grade IX and X in high and higher secondary schools of Punjab, Pakistan.

## **Chapter One**

### **Introduction**

#### **1.1 Chapter Overview**

This chapter provides a detailed description of the background and the critical issues related with the research problem under investigation. The purposes and objectives of the current study have been presented to indicate the motives behind the current research endeavor. As research questions are the backbone of well directed research study, therefore, the research questions related with the research problem have been outlined in the chapter. The significance of the current research study has been discussed. A brief description of research methodology being applied has also been given.