

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

**PROBLEMS FACED IN IMPLEMENTATIONS OF NATIONAL
CURRICULA UNDER NATIONAL TEXTBOOK POLICY 2007**

(A CASE STUDY OF PUNJAB, PAKISTAN)



Mazhar Hayat
ID # 14018088016

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES AND HUMANITIES
UNIVERSITY OF MANAGEMENT AND TECHNOLOGY,
LAHORE
2018

**PROBLEMS FACED IN IMPLEMENTATIONS OF NATIONAL
CURRICULA UNDER NATIONAL TEXTBOOK POLICY 2007**

(A CASE STUDY OF PUNJAB, PAKISTAN)



Mazhar Hayat
ID # 14018088016

**DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES AND HUMANITIES
UNIVERSITY OF MANAGEMENT AND TECHNOLOGY,
LAHORE
2018**

Certificate of Approval

The thesis title “Why Government Preferred Non-implementation over Implementation of Latest Curricula for Grade-VIII, for 2014 -2015? A Case Study of Punjab Pakistan” has been accepted by the faculty of Department of Education School of Social Science and Humanities, University of Management and Technology, Lahore in partial fulfilment of the requirements for degree of M.Phil in Education.

Supervisor

External Examiner

Director Graduate Study SSSH

Chairperson Department of Education

Dean, SSS&H

Date: _____

DEDICATION

This research work thesis is dedicated to

THE MOHSAN-E-INSANIAT ﷺ;

THE LAST HOLY PROPHET ﷺ;

THE LAST HOLY RASUL ﷺ;

HAZRAT MUHAMMAD ﷺ.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Every discipline has its own language, structure, philosophy, behaviour, means of communications. Domain of knowledges of the disciplines are so diverse and extensive that one cannot achieve entire knowledge of a single discipline in his/ her life. However, span of time coupled with commitment determines maturity of an individual in the setting of the discipline. All the students experience increasing diversity diverging towards surfaces of some disciplines up to Secondary Classes. However, they experience increasing diversity converging to depths of reducing disciplines beyond Secondary Classes.

The researcher did his MSc in the discipline of Mathematics and consciously preferred the job of textbook development as Subject Specialist of Punjab Textbook Board (PTB). However, expansion in experience of the researcher kept on strengthening his concept that the textbook development system is lacking something for nothing. Moreover, training sessions filled with terminologies obstructed learning and managing the researcher himself to expose and/ or explore deficiencies of the system on his own. Anyway, the system gave me ample opportunities keep on learning law. Though it was a tough decision to widen enhanced study but the researcher again took conscious, quite bold and correct decision to switchover new discipline i.e., Education.

The researcher is quite thankful to Professor Sajid Masood whose temperament, teaching style, readiness to guide and technical support became the only reason for the researcher continue beyond one month during which he overcame the feeling of being alien in the new discipline.

The researcher is also thankful to all of his teachers, particularly, Dr. Muhammad Amin, Dr. Yasira Waqar, Dr Elisabeta Zelinka for building his concepts. The researcher would love to acknowledge commendable supervision of Dr. Abdul Hammeed as his vision

and dedication brought the entire SSS & H of UMT Lahore campus on auto mode. The researcher enjoyed informal learning from him as well but never visited him for solution of some problems as no problem was there for him to solve. He could produce such a smooth and peaceful environment because visionary, competent and dedicated leadership remained available to the Department of Education, SSS & H, UMT Lahore.

The researcher is lucky of having long association with Dr. Seema Arif as most of the courses for his batch were with her. She not only remained busy but fresh & energetic even while she faced health issues. She remained surrounded by the students all the time due to instinct of her charismatic personality. In short, she is knowledgeable, a good teacher, proactive leader, visionary, sympathetic and kind to everyone. The researcher, place her as top of the options for research supervisor and, by the grace of Allah Almighty, he remained lucky for doing research under her kind & valued supervision.

The researcher realizes covert practical support of his parents (real, and in law); all previous teachers; his wife being sincere, honest, eminent educationist, learned, intellectual, graceful, highly reliable figure in her own discipline; Fatima Mazhar, Bilal Mazhar & Sarah Mazhar (his children); sisters & brothers (real & in laws) their daughters/ granddaughters & sons/ grandsons; and friends who had to face his careless attitude towards them. The researcher admires their silent sacrifices enabling him take moves to safeguard the system.

The crux of academic and practical life of the researcher is “Obedience of law is the only way towards survival leading to progress”.

Infinite thanks to Allah Almighty who blessed us with characteristics of selflessness as well as commitment.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table/ Chapter	Title	Page no.
	Acknowledgment	v
	Abstract	x
Chapter 1	Introduction	1
1.1	The Purpose of the Study	2
1.2	Aims and Objectives	2
1.3	Research Questions	3
1.4	Rationale of the Study	4
1.5	Problem Statement	7
1.6	Theoretical Framework and Boundaries	8
1.7	Originality/ Value	8
Chapter 2	Literature Review	9
2.1	Textbooks, Education and Development	9
2.1.1	Textbook and Education	10
2.1.1.1	Textbook	10
2.1.1.2	Role of Textbook	11
2.1.2	Textbook and Selection	11
2.1.3	Education and Development	13
2.2	18 th Amendment-Devolution of Power	15
2.2.1	Education, a Vested Right in Pakistan	15
2.2.2	Textbook Development in Pakistan	15
2.2.3	National Textbooks and Learning Materials Policy and Plan of Action, 2007	20
2.3	Evaluation, Quality and Approval of Textbooks	22
2.4	The Case of Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board	37
2.4.1	Textbook Development Modes in PCTB	41
Chapter 3	Research Design	44
3.1	Research Paradigm	45
3.2	Research Methodology	45
3.2.1	The Case Study	46
3.3	Population and Sample for the Study	47
3.3.1	Population for the Research Study	47
3.3.1.1	Trainers	48
3.3.1.2	Subject Coordinators	48
3.3.1.3	Private Publishers	48
3.3.1.4	Relevant Educationists	50
3.3.2	Sample for the Study	50
3.3.2.1	Trainers	50
3.3.2.2	Subject Coordinators	50
3.3.2.3	Private Publishers	50
3.3.2.4	Relevant Educationists	50
3.3.3	Research Tools	50
3.3.4	Sampling Technique	52
3.4	Data Collection Techniques and Research Tools	53
3.4.1	Document Analysis	54
3.4.1.1	National Documents	54
3.4.1.2	Provincial Documents	55

3.4.1.3	Organizational Documents	55
3.4.2	In-Depth Interviews	56
3.4.3	Focus-Group Discussion	57
3.5	Study Protocol	58
3.6	Data Collection Process	58
3.7	Data Analysis	59
3.7.1	Familiarization	60
3.7.2	Transcription	60
3.7.3	Organization	60
3.7.4	Themes Development	61
3.7.5	Descriptive and Interpretive Analysis	61
3.8	Reliability of the Research	61
3.9	Validity of the Research Study	62
3.10	Triangulation	63
3.11	Ethical Consideration	64
Chapter 4	Data Analysis and Interpretation	65
4.1	Data Source Documents	66
4.1.1	National Documents	66
4.1.2	Provincial Documents	67
4.1.3	Organizational Documents	67
4.2	Document Analysis	68
4.2.1	Vision - First National Educational Conference, 1947	80
4.2.2	Sharif Commission's Report, 1959	81
4.2.2.1	Multiple Textbooks, Decline of Education	82
4.2.2.2	Recommendations	82
4.2.3	The Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973	83
4.2.4	Federal Supervision of Curricula, Textbooks and Maintenance of Standards of Education Act, 1976	86
4.2.5	NTLMP – 2007	87
4.2.6	PCA Act, 2012	88
4.2.7	PCTB	90
4.2.8	Organizational Documents	91
4.3	Process of Themes Development	93
4.3.1	Themes of the Study	94
4.4	Descriptive Analysis of Themes	107
4.5	Beyond Selections	138
4.5.1	PTB	138
4.5.2	SED GoPP	138
4.5.3	BoG of PCTB	142
4.5.4	Secretary SED	143
4.5.5	Secretary Law	145
4.5.6	CMPP	145
4.5.7	Anti-Corruption Court	146
Chapter 5	Summary, Conclusions, Findings, Discussions and Suggestions	147
5.1	Summary of the Study	147
5.2	Limitations and Delimitations of the Study	149
5.3	Strengths of the Study	150
5.4	Conclusions of the Study	150
		151

5.5	Discussion upon Conclusions of the Study	153
5.6	Findings of the Study	158
5.6.1	Education	159
5.6.2	Law and Parliament Affairs	161
5.6.3	Management Science	163
5.7	Implications of the Study	163
5.7	Recommendations for Future Research	164
5.7.1	Education	164
5.7.2	Law and Parliament Affairs	165
5.7.3	Management Science	165
	Abbreviations	166
	Reference	167

LIST OF TABLES

Tables	Title	Page no.
Table 1.1	NCEE Construction.....	5
Table 3.1	Participants of the Research Study.....	53
Table 4.1	Document Analysis.....	69
Table 4.2	Coding of Themes.....	95
Table: 4.3	Feedback.....	131
Table 4.4	National Newspapers.....	132

PROBLEMS FACED IN IMPLEMENTATION OF NATIONAL CURRICULA UNDER NATIONAL TEXTBOOK POLICY 2007 (A CASE STUDY OF PUNJAB-PAKISTAN)

Mazhar Hayat

ABSTRACT

In 2006, the Curriculum Wing of the Federal Ministry of Education, Pakistan notified curricula of different subjects and grades. It also notified National Textbooks and Learning Materials Policy and Plan of Action in the year 2007. However, implementation of both the national official documents remained far behind the schedule. In pursuance of 18th amendment in the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan – 1973, Government of the Punjab established the Punjab Curriculum Authority in 2012. Punjab Curriculum Authority was entrusted the role of Federal Ministry of Education Curriculum Wing (defunct) for the province of Punjab-Pakistan. Since then, the Punjab Curriculum Authority approved dozens of manuscripts of different subjects including 116 manuscripts of seven subjects for grade VIII for the session 2014-2015. However, Government of the Punjab Schools' Education Department rejected these 116 approved textbooks. Rejection of approved manuscripts, appearing as unique event in the textbook development history of Pakistan, attracted the researcher to investigate non-implementation of the latest curricula. A qualitative case study design was opted for research employing both triangulation of sources and methods, using both primary and secondary data for research. This study fills the gap of the literature which is silent about the problems in implementation of latest Curricula under the National Textbooks and Learning Materials Policy and Plan of Action 2007. The study concludes that textbooks are carrier of biases or influences like background, and beliefs of the authors and consumer groups as well as political and interest groups who finance the textbook market.

Though literature on textbook writing and policy provides rich guidelines to ensure quality of textbooks but unfortunately priorities of the persons involved in the approval processes tend to find supremacy over directives for quality.

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Publication of a textbook is the major component of the curriculum implementation. Once curricula are notified, their implementation in prescribed manners becomes obligatory for the relevant authorities. During 2006 and 2007, Federal Ministry of Education Curriculum Wing (herein after referred as FMoECW) of Pakistan notified the National Curricula (herein after referred as NC) of different subjects from grade I to XII. Moreover, FMoECW also notified the National Textbooks and Learning Materials Policy and Plan of Action 2007 (herein after referred as NTLMP-2007) to be followed for implementation of the curricula. That is, NTLMP-2007 envisaged multiple textbooks to be developed under the supervision of private publishers. The FMoECW initiated implementation of the latest NC under NTLMP-2007 since the session 2008-2009. However, response of the private publishers was too slow in the beginning.

In the year 2010, the 18th constitutional amendment transferred the education subject from Federal Government to the Provincial Government. Subsequently, AJ and K entrusted the role of FMoECW to its Directorate of Curriculum Research Department (herein after referred as DCRD). However, all other provinces except Punjab entrusted this task to their provincial Curriculum Research and Development Centres (herein after referred as CRDC). The province of Punjab had merged its CRDC into Punjab Textbook Board (herein after referred as PTB) in 2002. Therefore, Punjab established Punjab Curriculum Authority (herein after referred as PCA) in the year 2012 to carry out this role.

PCA undertook implementation of latest NC of different subjects and grades under NTLMP-2007 during the years 2012-2013. PCA approved 116 textbooks of seven subjects