

The role of monitoring and evaluation in the public sector development projects: a case study of the Punjab cities governance improvement project (PCGIP)



Supervised by Prof.Sohail Ahmad
School of Governance and Society

Shan Ali MS Public Policy

School of Governance and Society (SGS)

University of Management and Technology, Lahore

2015

PREFACE

In this current era of economic development and growth, Monitoring and Evaluation is gaining more significance and currency. In this context, a good monitoring and evaluation system of a development project may assure to achieve its objectives and set goals in time. As due to rapidly growing urban population of the big cities of the country, socio-economic and governance issues are on the rise, so government of the Punjab is trying to bring some changes and reforms in the governance system to large extent through different development projects going on (Punjab Growth Strategy 2018) in the province. Punjab Cities Governance Improvement Project (PCGIP) is one of them---a World Bank funded project, trying to meet some relevant challenges faced by the province.

I am hereby very grateful to, Prof. Sohail Ahmad from the School of Governance and Society, University of Management and Technology, Lahore who supervised me and provided me all guidelines required, and intellectually supported me in the completion of this paper. Here, I also offer my deep thanks to Prof. Mr. Muhammad Feyyaz from the School of Governance and Society, University of Management and Technology, Lahore who helped me in organizing this paper in accordance with the accepted research standards and rules. At the same time, I hereby also offer my special thanks to ; Dr. Junaid Tahir Monitoring and Evaluation expert at the Urban Unit Punjab, Mr. Muhammad Masood, Director Evaluation, Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation P & D Department Government of the Punjab, Mr. Zahid Ali, Chief Policy Support, DG M & E, Planning and Development Department Punjab, and Mr. Muhammad Assad Khan, Director Coordination, DG M & E, Planning and Development Department Punjab, Lahore who supported me and shared their deep knowledge and experiences which enabled me to complete this study. In this regard, I am deeply indebted to all of them.

DEDICATION

The paper has been dedicated to the Prophet (*Peace be upon him*) of Allah, who is the savior of mankind and a source of light for the Universe.....

ABSTRACT

This paper is based on the role of monitoring and evaluation towards improved governance-- a case study of the Punjab Cities Governance Improvement Project (PCGIP) as a research design. Owing to growing social, economic and governance challenges to the province, a number of governance issues are on the rise. Hence, in order to tackle governance mismanagement, the government of the Punjab is committed to improve the services delivery and provision of other civic services through improved governance system in the province with the coordination of city entities like, CDGs, WASAs and DAs of the five big selected cities of the province. The project is being funded by the World Bank (with worth amount US \$150 million) which is working in the five major cities of the province namely; Lahore, Faisalabad, Rawalpindi, Multan and Gujranwala. The project has established seven Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) to measure the annual based performance and progress of the project in the respective cities through their proper monitoring and evaluation. This, M & E system provides overall a framework of action and mechanism in achieving the desired objectives and goals of a project within its set costs and time limit. Thus, monitoring measures the performance of implementation of an ongoing project to check and highlight any deviation. At the same time, evaluation is made to gauge the impact of activities performed, in addition, it also enhances our experience and learning in both cases of success and failure as well. In this study, the role of monitoring and evaluation (M&E) is being studied as a fundamental tool to measure the level of effectiveness, efficiency, transparency and accountability, and a way forward to improve governance system in the Punjab province. This may ensure improved municipal services delivery to the citizens and good living standards in the selected cities. The study is following qualitative approach, while data have been collected through structured interviews which has been analyze through content

analysis method. At the end of the paper for improvements of the project, certain recommendations have also been offered.

ACRONYMS

ADP	:	Annual Development Plan
CDG	:	City District Government
CEO	:	Chief Executive Officer
CPU	:	City Program Unit
DA	:	Development Authority
DG M&E:		Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation
DLI	:	Disbursement Linked Indicator
ESMF	:	Environment and Social Management Framework
ESMP	:	Environment and Social Management Plan
E & TD	:	Excise and Taxation Department
FCCI	:	Faisalabad Chamber of Commerce and Industry
GCU	:	Government College, University
GDP	:	Gross National Product
GHQs	:	General Head Quarters
GIS	:	Geological Information System
GOP	:	Government of the Punjab
GT Road	:	Grand Trunk Road
IFIs	:	International Financial Institutions
KPIs	:	Key Performance Indicators
LL.M	:	Master of Law

Development

OECD : Organization of Economic Cooperation and
Development

O & M : Operation and Management

OSR : Own Source Revenue

PCGIP : Punjab Cities Governance Improvement Project

P & D D : Planning and Development Department

PFC : Provincial Finance Commission

PMU : Punjab Management Unit

PTC : Punjab Technical Cell

SOP : Standard Operating Procedure

TOR : Terms of Reference

TPV : Third Party Validation

UNICEF: United Nation International Children's Emergency
Fund

M & E : Monitoring and Evaluation

WASA : Water and Sanitation Agency

WB : World Bank

UIPT : Urban Immoveable Property Taxation

UMT: University of Management and Technology, Lahore

USPMSU : Urban Sector Planning and Management Services Unit

UNDP : United Nation Development Program

USD : United State Dollar

TABLE OF FIGURES

FIGURE 1: The city District Lahore map.....	59
FIGURE 2: The city District Faisalabad map.....	61
FIGURE 3: The city District Rawalpindi map.....	63
FIGURE 4: The city District Gujranwala map.....	65
FIGURE 5: The city District Multan map.....	66

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE.....	ii
DEDICATION.....	iii
ABSTRACT.....	iv
ACRONYMS.....	v
TABLE OF FIGURES.....	vii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	viii
SECTION I: INTRODUCTION.....	10
I.I Introduction to the Topic.....	10
I.II Statement of the Problem.....	17
I.III Significance and Scope of the Study.....	19
I.IV Literature Review.....	21
I.V Research Methodology.....	46
I.VI Organization of the Paper.....	49
SECTION II the Punjab Cities Governance Improvement Project: An Overview.....	52
SECTION III Analysis of the Data collected	67
SECTION IV Findings of the Study	84
SECTION V Summary and Conclusions.....	87
SECTION VI Recommendations.....	91
Limitations.....	92
SECTION VII Appendices.....	94

SECTION I INTRODUCTION

I.1 Introduction to the topic

“Good governance is perhaps the single most important factor in eradicating poverty and promoting development” (Former UN Secretary General **Kofi Annan**)

Good monitoring and evaluation system can play a key role in enhancing the level of effectiveness, progress and efficiency of a development project through regular inspections, reviews, audits and control. Monitoring and evaluation system provides us with a framework of action which can help in organizing and managing of a development project. This system is considered as the fundamental tool during the developmental activities. This can also bring more efficacy and conciseness to a development project. It has also been described that monitoring and evaluation are interactive and mutually supportive processes (European Commission Civil Society Fund in Ethiopia, 2007) to improve efficiency of a development project. At the same time, a strong M & E system in return produces a new approach to improve the planning and implementation process of future projects (Planning and Development, Division, 1991). Thus, without an organized monitoring system in operation, no development project can be completed according to the requirement of the stakeholders within the set standards. While evaluation provides guidance for the future planning, decision making and policy formulation (UNICEF: Program Policy and Procedures Manual, 2003). The project monitoring and evaluation is based on the project performance that requires monitoring and evaluation of activities and outputs which are closely related to the project execution. As far as project impacts are concerned, they must be assessed by the outcome and indicators of the ongoing development projects. According

to United Nation Development Program (UNDP) these two can be defined as, “Monitoring is a continuing function that aims primarily to provide program or project management and the main stakeholders of an ongoing program or project with early indications of progress or lack thereof in the achievement of program or project objectives.” (UNDP, 1997).According to a document on M &E (Policy Guideline & Methodology,2010) there are three core elements of monitoring as; quality,time and cost which must kept in mind while carrying out monitoring of any project. While, “Evaluation is a time bound exercise that attempts to assess systematically and objectively the relevance, performance and success of ongoing and completed programs and projects.” (UNDP, 1997).At the same time, evaluation also imparts sound knowledge and experience for the future decision making and policy formulation as well. As the time going the public demand for quality government services are on the rise, so in order to achieve the objectives, governments are increasing the utilization of Monitoring and Evaluation (M & E) which has become the essential element of Good Governance. At the same time, M & E of development projects results in improvement in their physical effectiveness (Mubin, Ahmad & Sial, 2011).