

The Dynastic Political Elites and Election Campaign in Pakistan (1970 to 2013)

Thesis for M. Phil. Degree in Political Science



Session: 2015-2017

RESEARCH SCHOLAR

TANIA SOHAIL

15005112007
DPS

SUPERVISOR

DR. GULL-I-HINA AMIR

ASSISTANT PROFESSOR,

Department of Political Science

University of Management and Technology, Lahore.

Declaration

I, Tania Sohail D/O Syed Sohail, ID No. 15005112007, student of M.Phil. Political Science at the University of Management and Technology, Lahore, do hereby solemnly affirm that this thesis entitled as **“The Dynastic Political Elites and Election Campaign in Pakistan (1970 to 2013)”**, is entirely my individual research work and has not been submitted to any other university or institution for any other purpose.

Signature of Department

Certificate of Approval

The thesis titled “The Dynastic Political Elites and Election Campaign in Pakistan (1970 to 2013)” been accepted by the faculty of Department of Political Science, School of Social Sciences and Humanities, University of Management and Technology, Lahore in partial fulfillment of the requirement for degree of M.Phil in Political Science.

Supervisor

External Examiner

Chairperson, Dept. of Political Science

Dean, SSS&H

Date

Acknowledgements

Foremost, I thank Allah, who provided me with all the opportunities that made this thesis possible. I am grateful to my supervisor, Dr Gul-i-Hina for her guidance and valuable insight throughout the preparation of thesis.

My sincere gratitude is due to Dr Sohaib for his valuable guidance and consistent support. I am indebted to Ms. Suman Saeed for his valuable comments and guidance on different phases of the research. Thanks are also due to Amna Sohail for helping in data entry.

Finally, but most importantly, I am sincerely thankful to my parents and my sisters for their constant support and encouragement during all phases of my thesis.

Dedication

TO MY

VERY DEAR PARENTS

WHOSE PRAYERS, LOVE AND ENCOURAGEMENT

*HAVE ALWAYS GUIDED ME TO RIGHT PATH & TO EVERYONE WHO HELPED,
STOOD WITH ME & ME ENCOURAGED ME IN FULFILLING MY ASPIRATIONS*

Abstract

The current study focuses on the nature of dynastic political elites and their election campaigns in Pakistan particularly from 1992 to 2013. The study unfolds the role of the dynastic elites in Pakistan while highlighting the factors that affected voting trends in Pakistan. The theories concerning the voting behaviour such as a School of Columbia and the School of Michigan inform the theoretical framework. The School of Columbia is linked to sociological factors such as race, class, religion, etc. while the School of Michigan gives more importance to psychosocial factors such as party identification, party age, specific group attachment and so forth. Both the sociological and psychosocial factors have been found significant in affecting voting trends in Pakistan. The study employs qualitative method to collect primary data. The study corroborates the manifestos of the major political dynastic elites with data collected through semi-structured interviews. The target group has been the people who voted in the general elections of Pakistan for the Pakistan Peoples' Party (PPP) and Pakistan Muslim League Noon (PMLN) in major elections. In addition, the study takes into account the opinions of university students in order to know their perceptive on the dynastic political elites and their new leaders.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements.....	i
Dedication	v
Certificate of Approval.....	iii
Abstract	vi
Chapter No 1	1
Introduction	1
1.1. Significance	1
1.2. Objectives of the Study	2
1.3. Main Argument	2
1.4. Period	3
1.5. Research Design	3
1.6. Research Question	3
1.7. Interpretive Qualitative method.....	3
1.8. Sampling.....	4
(a) Sample Frame	4
(b) Group of Respondents.....	5
1.9. Data collection	5
(a) Primary Sources	6
(b) Research Instrument	6
(c) Secondary Sources	7
(d) Triangulation of the sampling.....	7
1.10. Data Analysis	7
(a) Documentary Analysis	7
(b) Thematic Analysis	8
1.11. Ethical Considerations.....	8
1.12. Delimitation of the Methodology	8
1.13. Chapter Outline.....	8
Chapter 2.....	11
Theoretical framework and Literature Review	11
2.1 Theoretical Framework.....	11

2.1.1 School of Columbia and Voting Prejudices	11
(a) Micro-sociological and macro-sociological approach	11
2.1.2 School of Michigan and Voting Prejudices.....	12
(a) Party Identification	12
(b) Party Age	13
2.2. Literature Review	14
Chapter No 3	23
Documentary Analysis	23
3.1 Manifesto of PPP	23
3.1.1 Manifesto 1970	23
3.1.2 Manifesto 1988	24
3.1.3 Manifesto 2008	26
3.2 The PMLN Manifesto	29
(a) Analysis of 2013 manifesto of PMLN	30
Chapter No 4	33
Analysis of interviews	33
4.1 Perception of voters of PPP voted among 1970-2013.....	34
(a) Reasons for Casting Vote to PPP	34
(b) Political Parties Identification.....	35
(c) Party Age	36
(d) Political Party Achievements	38
(i) Attainment of the Person	39
(e) Psychological Attachment	39
(i) Attachment with the Party or the party leadership	39
(ii) Casting a vote for the Personality.....	40
(iii) Casted Vote for the Same Party and Person.....	41
(iv) Casted Vote to and for the Same Person (in the other elections as well)	43
(v) Casted vote for - Leader or Political Party or Family	44
(f) Political Socialization	45
(i) Family Influence on voting opinion	45
(g) Appear in Difficult Time	46
(i) Leader Emerged as Charismatic Leader.....	46

(ii) Elected party under charismatic leadership	47
(h) Clear vision	48
(i) Awareness about the Party Manifesto	48
(j) Strong visual presence, looks/ speech:	49
(i) Strong Visual Presence	49
(ii) Good communication silks.....	50
(k) Innovative ideas/ communicate a vision to a supporter	50
(L) Ability to Easily Gather Support	51
(m) Future Perception of the Pakistan Politics	52
(i) Support of Next Generations of the Party	52
(ii) Party Choice for 2018 Elections	53
4.2 Perception of voters of PPP voted among 1988-2013.....	53
(a) People Identity PPP.....	53
(i) Reasons for casting a vote to PPP.....	53
(b) Identification with a political party	54
(c) Party age	55
(d). Political Party Achievements	56
(i) Achievement of the person	56
(ii) Achievements of the Party/Leader	57
(e) Psychological Attachment	58
(i) Attachment with the Party and the Party leadership	58
(iii) Casted vote for the personality	59
(iv) Casted Vote for the same party and Person: (in the other election).....	59
(v) Casted Vote to and for the same person (in the other elections)	60
(vi) Casted vote for - Leader or Political Party or Family	61
(f) Political Socialization	62
(i) Family Influence on voting opinion.....	62
(g) Appear in Difficult Time	63
(i) A leader emerged as a charismatic leader.....	63
(ii) Elected party under charismatic leadership	64
(h) Clear vision	65
(i) Awareness about the party manifesto	65
(l) Strong visual presence, looks/ speech.....	65

(i) Strong Visual presence.....	66
(ii) Good communication silks.....	66
(j) Innovative ideas/ communicate a vision to a supporter	67
(i) Ability to Easily Gather Support	68
(k) Future Perception of Pakistani Politics	69
(i) Support of Next Generations of the Party	69
(ii) Party Choice for 2018 Elections	69
4.3 Perception of voters of PPP voted among 2008-2013.....	70
(a) People Identity PPP.....	70
(b) Reasons for Casting Vote to PPP.....	70
(c) Political Parties Identification	71
(d) Party Age	72
(e) Political Party Achievements	72
(i) Achievement of the Person	73
(ii) Psychological Attachment.....	74
(iii) Cast vote for the person	74
(iv) Cast Vote for the Personality	74
(v) Attachment with the Party or the party leadership	75
(vi) Cast vote to the same party in the other election	75
(vii) Cast vote for the same person in the other election	76
(viii) Cast vote for the same leader in the other election	76
(ix) Cast a vote for the person.....	77
(x) Cast a vote for political party	77
(xi) Cast a vote for the family.....	77
(f) Political Socialization	78
(i) Family Influence in voting opinion	78
(g) Appear in Difficult Time	79
(i) Leader Emerged as Charismatic Leader.....	79
(ii) Elected party under charismatic leadership	79
(h) Clear Vision	80
(i) Awareness about manifesto	80
(l) Strong visual presence, looks/ speech	81
(i) Strong Visual Presence.....	81

(ii) Good communication skills	82
(j) Innovative ideas/ communicate a vision to a supporter	82
(i) Ability to Easily Gather Support	83
(k) Future Perception of Pakistani Politics	84
(i) Support of next generations of the Party	84
(ii) Party Choice for 2018 Elections	85
Chapter 5.....	86
Affiliation of voters with PML-N	86
5.1 Perception of voters of PMLN, voted in 1988-2013	86
(a) People's identity of PMLN.....	86
(b) Reasons for Casting Vote for PMLN	86
(c) Political Parties Identification	87
(d) Party age	88
(e) Political party achievements of PMLN.....	88
(i) Achievement of the person	89
(f) Psychological Attachment	90
(i) Attachment with the party or the party leader	90
(ii) Cast vote for the personality.....	91
(iii) Cast vote for the person / political party/ family (in other election as well)	91
(g) Political socialization.....	92
(i) Family influence in voting opinion	92
(h) Appear in difficult time	93
(i) Leader Emerged as Charismatic Leader	93
(ii) Elected party under charismatic leadership	94
(l) Clear Vision	94
(i) Awareness about the Party Manifesto	94
(j) Strong visual presence, countenance/speech	95
(i) Strong visual presence	95
(ii) Good communication skills	96
(k) Innovative ideas/ communicate a vision to a supporter	97
(L) Ability to Easily Gather Support	97
(m) Future Perception of the Pakistani Politics	98
(i) Support of Next Generations of the Party	98

(ii) Party Choice for 2018 Elections	99
5.2 Perception of voters of PMLN, voted among 2008-2013	100
(a) People identity PMLN	100
(b) Reasons for Casting Vote to PML (N)	100
(c) Political Party Identification	101
(d) Party Age	102
(e) Political Party Achievement	102
(i) Party Achievements	103
(iii) Achievement of the Person	103
(iv) Achievements of the Party/Leader	104
(f) Psychological Attachment	104
(i) Cast Vote for the Person	104
(ii) Attachment with the Party and the Person (party leader)	105
(iii) Cast Vote for the same party and Person	106
(iv) Cast Vote for the same person (in other election as well)	107
(v) Cast vote for - Leader or Political Party or Family	107
(g) Political Socialization	108
(i) Family Influence in Casting Vote	108
(h) Appear in difficult time	109
(i) Leader Emerged as Charismatic Leader	109
(ii) Voted Party Is Emerged as A Charismatic Party	110
(l) Clear vision	110
(i) Awareness about the Party Manifesto	111
(j) Strong visual presence, looks/ speech	111
(j) Innovative Ideas/ communicate a vision to a supporter	112
(L) Ability to easily gather support	113
(M) Future Perception of Pakistani Politics	114
(i) Support of Next Generations of the Party	114
(ii) Party Choice for 2018 Elections	115
Chapter 6	116
Young Leadership and Affiliation of the University Voters the Dynastic Political elite of Pakistan	116
(a) Reason of Casting Voting	116

(b) Political socialization	117
• Family voting trend	117
• Family influence in voting opinion	118
(c) Political Party identification	118
(d) Clear vision.....	119
• Awareness about the party manifesto	119
(e) Party age	120
(f) Group attachment	120
(g) Physiological attachment.....	121
• Vote for Personality	121
• Casted voted to political family	122
• Casted vote for political party.....	123
(i) Innovative ideas	123
(j) Believe in prosperity	124
(k) Working for achieving prosperity	125
(l) Easily gather support	126
(m) Communication of vision	126
(n) Party vision.....	127
(o) Transfer of power to next generation	128
(p) Future perception of Pakistani politics	129
Chapter 7.....	131
Findings of the Document Analysis.....	131
7.1 Manifesto of PPP.....	131
7.2 Manifesto of PMLN	133
Chapter 8.....	135
Interview findings of affiliation of voters with PPP	135
8.1 Perception of voters of PPP, voted in 1970	135
8.2 Perception of voters of PPP, voted in 1988	138
8.3 Perception of voters of PPP, voted in 2008	140
Chapter 9.....	143
Interview Findings of affiliation of voters with PML-N	143
9.1. Perception of voters of PMLN voted in 1993.....	143

9.2 Perception of voters of PMLN, voted in 2013.....	146
Chapter 10.....	150
Young Leadership and Affiliation of the University Voters with the Dynastic elite of the Pakistan.....	150
Section Two.....	155
(a) Cross Section triangulation of PPP and PMLN	155
(b) Within section triangulation of the manifesto of PPP and PMLN.....	155
Chapter 11.....	157
Conclusion and Recommendations	157
Recommendations	159
References	160

Chapter No 1

Introduction

Dynastic politics is not a new phenomenon in Pakistan. Both the major ruling parties of Pakistan, Pakistan People's Party (PPP) and Pakistan Muslim League Noon (PMLN), qualify as dynastic elites. Dynastic elites are mostly found in third world countries such as India, Philippines, Thailand, Indonesia and Singapore (Purdey, 2016). The tradition of dynastic politics has been developing in these countries since the non-dynastic elites face more challenges than dynastic elites such as financial issues, establishing credibility in political spheres, attracting voters and managing the vote bank. In Pakistan, people are not willing to try new faces in politics and their voting activity not a single member's decision. In fact, people cast their votes just to show their loyalty to their families and political parties and hence encourage dynastic political system (Akhtar and Mushtaq, 2014).

Another factor that contributes to voting behavior is Party identification that results from a psychological affiliation are the psychological affiliation. The party identification can be an individual choice or a result of social influence; an individual shows attachment but family and social environment influence his/her choices. Usually, people keep voting for the same party as they do not want to take any risk for the new leaders. Sometimes, the performance of the political party in one tenure acts as an asset for its descents which they keep on cashing in subsequent years. The dynastic elites make sure that the people of their country trust them and reciprocate to show their attachment to the particular party through their votes and their behaviour (Brian, 2010).

1.1. Significance

Due to well-established dynastic elites in Pakistan, the emerging political leadership/political parties of Pakistan face lack of public acceptance. The connection of the dynastic political elites and election campaign in Pakistan is of crucial importance in